

Ayşe İrem Kırac Favre-Felix

**THE LEGITIMACY OF CIVIL SOCIETY
PARTICIPATION IN GLOBAL GOVERNANCE:
PROSPECTS FOR THE WORLD TRADE
ORGANIZATION**

CONTENTS

FIGURES AND TABLES.....	XV
ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS.....	XVII
INTRODUCTION	1
I. The Issue.....	1
II. The Relevance	6
III. The Project.....	10
IV. The Approach.....	11
V. The Limitations.....	14
VI. The Structure.....	18

PART ONE

DEMOCRATIC LEGITIMACY, GLOBAL LAW- MAKING AND THE WTO

1. RECASTING THE WTO LEGITIMACY DEBATE: LEGITIMACY OF INTERNATIONAL LAW AND THE WTO	25
1.1. Introduction.....	25
1.2. Paradigm Shift in the Debate of ‘Legitimacy of International Law’	27
1.2.1. In General.....	27
1.2.2. Allocation of Authority in International Law and Global Governance	36
1.2.3. Accountability Mechanisms in International and Global Law-making.....	46
1.2.4. Inclusion of New Actors in Global Law	50

1.3. Relevance of the Legitimacy Debate to the World Trade Organization	56
1.3.1. Economic Globalization by Definition	56
1.3.2. Brief History of Development of World Trade Law: From GATT to the WTO	57
1.3.3. Cooperation-Seeking in International Trade Regime.....	64
1.3.4. Connecting the Trade Regime to Wider Historical Context	72
1.3.5. Social Constructivism and the Legitimacy of the WTO Regime	80
1.4. Conclusion	98
2. THE CURRENT REGIME OF LEGITIMACY FOR THE WTO AND ITS CRITIQUE	102
2.1. Introduction	102
2.2. The Current Regime of Legitimacy for the WTO	103
2.2.1. The WTO Functions and Objectives.....	103
2.2.1.1. The WTO Functions	103
2.2.1.2. The WTO Objectives	104
2.2.2. Trade-and-Issues and Regulatory Effect of the WTO	107
2.2.2.1. Trade and Development.....	111
2.2.2.2. Trade and Environment	121
2.2.2.3. Trade, Public Health and Human Rights.....	125
2.2.2.4. Trade and Labour	130
2.2.3. The Institutional Design of the WTO.....	132
2.2.3.1. The Main Structure and the Organs of the WTO	132
2.2.3.1.1. Ministerial Conferences	132
2.2.3.1.2. General Council.....	133
2.2.3.1.3. Dispute Settlement Body and Dispute Settlement Mechanism.....	134
2.2.3.1.4. Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TPRM)	136

2.2.3.1.5. Councils, Committees, Working Groups and Working Parties	137
2.2.3.1.6. Trade Negotiations Committee	139
2.2.3.1.7. WTO Secretariat	139
2.2.3.2. The Decision/Law-Making in the WTO	144
2.2.3.3. Protocols of Accession and Withdrawal	151
2.2.4. Participatory Mechanisms within the WTO	154
2.2.4.1. Internal Participation in WTO Decision-Making	154
2.2.4.2. Relations with External Actors and Public Participation in the WTO	158
2.2.5. Transparency of the WTO and WTO Documents	162
2.3. The Critique of the Current Regime of Legitimacy for the WTO	170
2.3.1. Procedural Legitimacy of the WTO	174
2.3.1.1. The Realm of the WTO	176
2.3.1.1.1. Authorization of the Law/Decision- making Mechanisms	176
2.3.1.1.2. Accountability	185
2.3.1.1.3. Participation	190
2.3.1.1.4. Transparency	194
2.3.1.1.5. Effective Law/Decision-making Process.	198
2.3.1.1.6. Power Imbalance and Inequality of Bargaining Power	206
2.3.1.2. The Realm of WTO Members	213
2.3.2. Substantive Legitimacy of the WTO	219
2.4. Conclusion	226
3. POLITICAL LEGITIMACY AND THE WTO	228
3.1. Introduction	228
3.2. Overview of Key Definitions, Sources of Legitimacy and Their Correlations	229
3.2.1. Legitimacy by Definition and its Sources	229

3.2.2. Description of the Sources of Legitimacy at a More Concrete Level	236
3.2.3. The Intersection between the Sources of Legitimacy.....	238
3.2.4. The Medium Role of Democracy for the Realization of Legitimacy	242
3.3. Transformations in Democratic Theory: From Aggregative to Deliberative	245
3.3.1. The Aggregative Model and its Critique	245
3.3.2. The Deliberative Model and its Critique.....	248
3.4. New Challenges: Democracy and Disagreement at the Global Level	254
3.5. Unfolding the WTO Legitimacy Problem: The Moral Aspect ..	261
3.5.1. Consent-Related Legitimacy Problem at International Law/Decision-Making and the WTO	261
3.5.1.1. The Inadequacy of Transferring Consent	265
3.5.1.2. Failure of Law/Decision-Making Bodies	272
3.5.1.3. Incapacity to Address Global Issues	274
3.5.1.4. Globalization and the Nature of Trade Law.....	279
3.5.2. Producing Legitimate Outcomes Concerning Global Distribution	281
3.6. Why Democratic Legitimacy for the WTO?	282
3.7. How to Progress towards More Legitimacy?	289
3.7.1. Theoretical Guidelines towards More Legitimacy.....	291
3.7.1.1. Theoretical Proposal: Democracy of Emancipation	291
3.7.1.2. The Form of Participation in Democracy of Emancipation	299
3.7.1.3. The Egalitarian Element in Democracy of Emancipation	301
3.7.1.3.1. The Critique of the Understanding of Equality in Deliberation	301
3.7.1.3.2. Equality and Discursive Participation	305

3.7.1.4. Needs and Interest Divergence in the Democracy of Emancipation	310
3.7.1.4.1. The Relation Between Autonomy, Needs and Interests	311
3.7.1.4.2. The Precedence of Needs over Interests..	314
3.7.1.5. The Global/Cosmopolitan Element in Democracy of Emancipation	319
3.7.1.6. Democracy of Emancipation and the Legitimacy Debate	321
3.7.2. The Starting Point: The Principle of ‘Sophrosyne’	326
3.8. Bringing a Fresh Perspective: Might the WTO Deadlock be a Request for Transformation?	328
3.9. Conclusion	330

PART TWO

CIVIL SOCIETY AND LEGITIMACY

4. THE ROLE OF CIVIL SOCIETY TO GLOBALIZE THE DEMOCRACY	333
4.1. Introduction	333
4.2. Analysis of the Concept of Civil Society	334
4.2.1. The Meaning and Main Characteristics of Civil Society...	335
4.2.2. Civil Society as a Separate Sphere	338
4.2.3. Appearances of Civil Society	342
4.2.4. The Role of Civil Society	347
4.3. Promising Qualities of Civil Society for Amelioration of the Consent-Related Legitimacy Problem and the WTO	353
4.3.1. New Platform for Transferring the Consent	353
4.3.2. Ameliorate Some Shortcomings in the Law/Decision- Making	363
4.3.3. Capacity for the Global Structure	373
4.4. The Current State of Civil Society and Shortcomings	376

4.4.1. Civil Society and Democratic Legitimacy.....	376
4.4.2. Civil Society and Organizational Typology.....	380
4.4.3. Problematic Areas Related to the Legitimacy of Civil Society Organizations.....	387
4.4.4. Further Reflections in Order to Advance the Legitimacy of Civil Society Organizations.....	390
4.4.4.1. General Remarks	390
4.4.4.2. Authorization of Civil Society Organizations	398
4.4.4.3. Participatory Mechanisms in Civil Society Organizations	403
4.4.4.4. Transparency Mechanisms in Civil Society Organizations	406
4.4.4.5. Accountability Mechanisms in Civil Society Organizations	408
4.4.4.6. Performance/Impact Assessment and Outcome Evaluation of Civil Society Organizations	411
4.4.5. Civil Society Organizations and Their Legitimacy- Building Capacity	415
4.5. Untapped Potential of Civil Society for Advancing the WTO Legitimacy.....	417
4.5.1. Civil Society to Improve the WTO Procedural Legitimacy	417
4.5.1.1. Potential Contribution of Civil Society to Authorization Scheme.....	417
4.5.1.2. Potential Contribution of Civil Society to Accountability Scheme	420
4.5.1.3. Potential Contribution of Civil Society to Transparency	432
4.5.1.4. Potential Contribution of Civil Society to Effective Decision-Making	436
4.5.2. Civil Society to Progress the WTO Substantive Legitimacy	436

4.5.2.1. Progress in ‘Global Justice of Distribution’	437
4.5.2.1.1. ‘Equal Positive Freedom’ Approach.....	439
4.5.2.1.2. Capability Approach.....	444
4.5.2.1.3. Civil Society and ‘Global Justice of Distribution’	451
4.5.2.2. Progress in Global Trade Agenda and Trade- Related Policy Goals	454
4.6. Conclusion	455
5. CIVIL SOCIETY PARTICIPATION IN THE WTO AND DRAWING LESSONS FROM INTERNATIONAL ORGANIZATIONS AND GLOBAL GOVERNANCE.....	459
5.1. Introduction.....	459
5.2. The Current Status of Civil Society Participation in the WTO .	460
5.2.1. Civil Society Participation under the WTO Agreement and the Practice (Related to Legislative and Executive Functions of the WTO).....	461
5.2.1.1. Access to the WTO Organs and Participatory Meetings with Civil Society	461
5.2.1.1.1. Guidelines on Relations with Civil Society.....	461
5.2.1.1.2. Civil Society Attendance at the Plenary Sessions of the Ministerial Conference.....	463
5.2.1.1.3. Initiative for Access Badges	469
5.2.1.1.4. The Trial of Informal CSO Advisory Body	470
5.2.1.1.5. Ad Hoc Symposia and the WTO Public Forums	471
5.2.1.1.6. Informal Meetings with CSOs and Information Exchange Opportunities	475
5.2.1.2. Access to the WTO Information for Civil Society and Transparency of the WTO Documents	477

5.2.1.2.1. Access to the WTO Documents.....	477
5.2.1.2.2. Information Resources for Civil Society .	479
5.2.1.2.3. Public Briefings and Trade Dialogues Series	479
5.2.2. Civil Society Participation and Transparency in the WTO Dispute Settlement System: the WTO Dispute Settlement Understanding and the Practice (Related to Judicial Function of the WTO)	480
5.2.2.1. Civil Society Participation in the WTO Dispute Settlement.....	480
5.2.2.2. Transparency in the WTO Dispute Settlement ...	493
5.3. Civil Society Participation in International Law and Global Governance: Various Approaches and Participatory Frameworks.....	504
5.3.1. The UN ECOSOC Approach to CS Participation.....	504
5.3.2. The ILO Approach to CS Participation.....	511
5.3.3. The WIPO Approach to CS Participation	518
5.3.4. The World Bank and Inspection Panel Approach to CS Participation.....	527
5.3.4.1. The World Bank.....	527
5.3.4.2. The World Bank Inspection Panel	532
5.3.5. Drawing Lessons from Diverse Approaches to CS Participation in Decision/Law-making and Dispute Settlement	538
5.4. Conclusion	544
6. PROPOSAL FOR NEW PARTICIPATORY MECHANISMS: RECOMMENDATIONS TO THE WTO AND CIVIL SOCIETY ORGANIZATIONS.....	547
6.1. Introduction	547
6.2. Taking Stock of the Theoretical Proposal.....	548
6.3. Proposal for New Participatory Mechanisms for Civil Society Participation: Recommendations to the WTO and the Other Actors Involved.....	551

6.3.1. Proposal for Civil Society Participation in the WTO Decision/Law-making Bodies (Related to Legislative and Executive Functions of the WTO).....	551
6.3.1.1. Recommendation for Improving the General Status of Civil Society Participations in the WTO	551
6.3.1.2. Recommendations to the WTO Ministerial Conference, General Council, Dispute Settlement Body and Trade Policy Review Body	558
6.3.1.3. Recommendations to the WTO Councils, Committees, Working Groups and Working Parties.....	560
6.3.1.4. Recommendations to the WTO Trade Negotiations Committee	562
6.3.1.5. Recommendations to the WTO Trade Policy Review Mechanism (TPRM)	564
6.3.1.6. Recommendations to the WTO Secretariat	567
6.3.2. Proposal for Civil Society Participation in the WTO Dispute Settlement System (Related to Judicial Functions of the WTO)	569
6.3.3. Recommendations to WTO Members	578
6.3.4. Recommendations to Civil Society Organizations	580
6.4. Conclusion	584
CONCLUDING REMARKS	587
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	601